

ANM 328 Project 1 Critique

Project one is a great introduction to the basic skills in Photoshop that you will typically use on most images you work with. Whether you're repairing a damaged photo or simply resizing a great digital image, Photoshop's tools will help you understand its characteristics and offer you a smorgasbord of options to enhance or modify.

Regarding project grades: I gave each project a level of difficulty rating from 1-10. 10 would be impossible to repair. If no repair work is required it would have a value of 1. My assessment of your final image and the level of difficulty are combined to make-up the project grade.

Late projects -10

No Critique -5 I check the critiques the day after they are due. No late critiques accepted.

95-100 Very successfully repaired major flaws and tonal deficiencies in a very challenging image

90-94 Image not as challenging but skillfully repaired flaws and exposure problems

85-89 Less challenging photo with minor flaws and tonal repairs. Mostly successful with repairs and adjustments

80-84 Photo is not very challenging. Repairs are minor and adjustments to tone and exposure are incomplete.

70-79 Photo not challenging. Flaws repaired but very minor. Does not demonstrate skill with the restore tools

Note: My assessment of difficulty level is at the start of your critique: As a group, you all did a very good job with your image restorations. Many were outstanding, As you compare my comments with your grade, please realize that although the results may look perfect I take into consideration what skill it took to get there and how challenging I thought your image was to work with. The first number is the level of difficulty.

Monroy Group

Kathern Bond-8/10 Your vintage portrait had a significant number of flaws to work with in the clothing and background. The face was in pretty good shape which made the repairs much more focused on spot healing techniques. The final image looks very good! I can see some slightly overworked areas at the top of his head. You may have discovered that lines of contrast such as hair to background do not work as well with the healing tools. The clone tool tends to be more successful since it's just copying pixels. Your tonal range is better but I think the collar could be whiter. The best way to do this is to set that white with the levels white point. There are three eye droppers in the levels panel..you can click on the white and then pick an area of the image that you want pure white and it will set it. Overall a very good job bringing this classic back to life!

William Goff 8+/10 What a wonderful old family photo. I first notice the improvement in contrast and tonal range. The restored image is probably more vivid than when it was originally taken and printed..that's the magic of digital restoration. You had a significant tear to work with across the image, which has been removed without a trace. Smaller creases and flecks have been very expertly retouched. Looks wonderful..excellent work!

Danielle Korotkin-7+/10 This is a wonderful old photo of a couple sitting for a portrait in front of a studio backdrop. The challenge comes from the discolored and missing areas in the background. How you fill-in the missing parts adds difficulty. I really like the improved tonal range with good highlights and shadows. The couple and car really stand out. Your repairs to the background have filled the missing areas but there is a pattern of identical trees on the left and remnants of overworking the background in the right half. This is very tricky...the best technique, which you have done is to copy good stuff and fill with it. If you change or modify slightly then repeated patterns won't be as visible.

Amanda Rodman-7+/10 Your original had significant flaws and you said you added more to increase the difficulty...it worked! The creases and scratches have disappeared. I also like the technique you used to remove the discoloration which typically comes from aging chemicals on the paper. My only comment is that it looks to me like the "shadow" off the woman's head is probably from the line of discoloration. Softening that edge would make it less obvious. Two techniques might be considered: you could try to select the darker shadow with magic wand (pixel color based) and then lighten to match the curtain or use a very soft brush with the dodge tool (selectively lightens) across the line of contrast. The photo and your retouching look great. I'm just pointing out where you could take this wonderful image one step further in the process.

Oscar Varela-8/10 This is a fun family photo that has definitely had some better days. You had to deal with a variety of scratches and stains. Fortunately, the faces were not significantly damaged. The repairs, especially on the wall look good. There are some signs of overworked areas to the right of the outlet. I suspect you used the healing brush in that area which can create some uneven coloration...it's so difficult to know when to stop. The repairs on the man's neck and face are excellent. I also see a slight improvement in tone and color. Nice work!

Mutter Group

Marchia Bond-7+/10 The only reason for the level of difficulty on your original was that the damage was not on the face or hands. There was a slight crease on the ankle. The flaws were generally in the background and most would have been fixed with the healing brush. You have done a great job of removing all the creases and scratches. The tonal range has been adjusted to enhance the highlights, which look much brighter. The color also looks more natural. To me it looks like the right ankle has a dark streak. Overall you've done a very good job restoring the photo.

Faith Hess-9/10 Your photo has a higher level of difficulty because the big crease goes directly across the subject's face. This type of flaw is more difficult to fix because alterations to the face are easier to detect and in general the face has a variety of structure and lighting which adds to the challenge. You did a good job with the flaws away from the face...magically gone! The face was more difficult and there still is some remnants of manipulation on the left and right of his mouth. Because the flaw was symmetrically across his mouth you didn't have any "good" image area to work with. Without the original image it would be hard to see any flaws....keep up the good work!

Bibiana Lopez-6/10 What a cute picture, but they don't look all that happy having to be photographed. The original has several flaws to address but was not too challenging with the flaws in the background. It looks like you added a bit of contrast and then used the healing brush to fix creases and color spot. I do see some uneven spots in the curtain area above the little girl's head. Sometimes this is caused by areas of contrast in the curtains that don't react well with the healing brush tool. The clone tool might work better..maybe you tried both. The flaws have been removed. Your technique looks good

Catherine Serou-5/10 It's a little hard to assess your original because it's quite small and pixilated. I do see a few spots that may have been artifacts in the background and the color is slightly washed out on her face. It's difficult to fix a picture with low resolution..just not enough good pixels to work with and as you enlarge it just gets harder to see and fix. The color adjustment, maybe just levels was required, has enhanced the contrast and tone.

Dawn Zylema-9/10 What a great class picture. Looks like a whole school or maybe a one room school house. Interesting story behind this picture I'm sure. This was definitely a challenging photo with major repairs that cut across the entire image and some faces. This is the most difficult image we had in class. Your repairs are amazing! I can't see any distortion or discoloration from your repairs. It looks like there may still be one tiny scratch on the girl's dark dress in middle row. This in no way detracts from the overall success of your restoration and was likely just a decision you made as to whether it was a flaw or part of her outfit. Outstanding work!

Kelsey Garrett-8/10 Great job bringing this damaged and discolored school photo back to life! The toughest repairs are ones that go across the face because they are easy to detect if not done precisely. Your restoration looks wonderful and you had to rebuild the ear on the right. Sometimes you can copy a good symmetrical side or part of the face then copy and flip horizontally to replace damaged areas. Don't know if this is what you did but whatever techniques you used were very successful. The color correction looks very natural. Excellent restoration!

Adams Group

Rudy Carson-7/10 This is a classic portrait with a painted canvas background, perhaps from early 1900's. You had some discoloration and a few flaws, most notable is the diagonal rub across the young man's suit. With these old photos, I typically recommend desaturating them to remove all color, do repairs and then re-tint as desired. It looks like you did some selective recoloring with a sepia tone gradient from left to right and slight tinting of the girl's cheeks. A description of your process would be informative. The tonal range is a little too high on the white side. Details in her dress, which are visible in the original, are a bit washed out but highlights/mid-tones on the faces are better. I would have use the healing brush to take out a few of the scratches in the background between the subjects. While not necessarily look for perfection, since it's a great period piece, they tend to distract from the subjects. Challenging photo with very creative techniques applied to it. (Late)

Jolaine Huss-8/10 This was a very challenging photo to restore. As you probably discovered, making adjustments to the whole photo would result in either the background getting discolored and pixilated or the subjects looking unnatural in the context of the scene. The best way to approach this, and perhaps you did, is to make a global adjustment with color to start. Auto Color does a pretty good job on the background. Then adjust levels for the whole picture. Finally use the quick selection tool to select just the man and girl by using a small brush diameter. With just the subjects selected, you can then independently fine tune their tone and color. You submitted a sampler of techniques. The retouch in color is the most successful. The subjects look brighter but the background looks soft and pixilated. Good job fixing the scratches. This was a very tough photo to repair due to the lighting and hard shadows. I appreciate seeing the variety of techniques. (no feedback)

Noah Martin8+/10 This was a very challenging photo with major tears and creases as well as very faded color. You have done a good job of retouching the creases and missing bits. It appears that you depended primarily on the healing brush. It works great but tends to leave blurred spots when you retouch over areas of contrast such as the border of the image. With this image, you could crop to the edge of the photo and then place it back onto the original to retain the border and date which is very important to the context of the image. Color correction is a problem. Color is very subjective but the photo still has a yellowish tone. You can go for the more challenging color balance palette or try the simple Image>Auto Color. If you did that you'd see a pink hat and more natural background. Give it a try. (no group critique)

Stephanie Sutter-9/10 I wouldn't normally recommend trying to fix a photo that is so out of focus and discolored. You can't bring back detail that's not there but you did creatively reconstruct the doll and some of her face. The result is certainly better than the original but still lacks overall detail and her eyes are rather harsh with the retouched whites. I think you did the best with what you had. It would have been better to work with a photo that was more detailed and focused so you could have better explored the restoration tools.

Taylor Group

Brian Coffman 8/10 This was a very challenging picture not necessarily because of the two major creases across the boy but because lighting on either side of the creases was dramatically different. If the real photo was scanned on a flatbed scanner, the weight of the lid might have equalized the lighting. You did a good job removing the crease marks but the slightly lighter tone above the top crease and darker tone below the bottom crease tend to stand out. The basic way to fix these darker/lighter areas is to select them (use the quick selection tool with a small brush) this is the tricky part. Then use the image>adjustment>levels to try to match the adjacent tone. Alternatively, you could make the transition from light to dark more-subtle by using the dodge tool with a soft edge brush. The dodge tool will lighten ever so slightly but can be easily overdone. I took more time explaining this because it's a common problem you can run into and thought others might like to know how to deal with it.

Taylor Johnston 8+/10 Wow! This is a wonderful old portrait that's suffered from abuse and discoloration. Desaturating the image, as you have done, is the best way to get started so you're not repairing discolored areas. The results are excellent and demonstrate excellent skill with the retouch tools. The restored photo looks slightly softer than the original..one full selection and application of the sharpen filter might just add a touch of sharpness. Overall, it looks great!

Heather Merrifield 7/10 There's weren't a lot of flaws in your original image. It appears to be slightly dark and lacks tonal range. The restored image is much brighter and I do like your technique of cropping away the damaged border. It looks like the tonal range could even be enhanced a bit more. One technique is to use the black/white eyedroppers in the levels panel. Once you select an eye dropper, say black, click on the darkest shadow to set that as the black point. Then do the same thing with the white eye dropper and set it on what you want to be pure white. Use the slider for mid-tones. If you wanted, you could bring back a ¼ inch border by going to image>canvas size and adding ¼ inch to each side in white. Not necessary but I just pointing out how it's easily done.

Vicky Vang 7+/10 This is a wonderful old portrait. The original lacks tonal range and has a sepia tone that may be from age. There are also some major chunks missing...fortunately they are not across the face. There are challenging and you've done an excellent job fixing the missing bits at the bottom left and right of the image. The tonal range is vastly improved..the original image had good detail and sharpness which was brought out with the improved contrast and tone. Excellent work!

Dannie Walkerb8/10 What a great old sports photo..at first glance it looked like they were playing football in the snow. Then I saw the viewers sitting on a hill in the background. The flaws around the edges were manageable and you've made them disappear (along with the people in the background). The more significant problem is tonal range which is rather weak and results in a flat greyish appearance. I suggest using the levels eye droppers as described in Heather's feedback above. It's a quick and usually successful way of setting strong black and white point in an image such as this.